Improving Teamwork Assessment: Examples & Applications

Su Swarat & Jyenny Babcock
California State University, Fullerton

Mihaylo 2017 Assessment Conference
AACU: Teamwork Skills are Important

The Essential Learning Outcomes

Knowledge of Human Cultures and the Physical and Natural World
- Through study in the sciences and mathematics, social sciences, humanities, histories, languages, and the arts

Focused by engagement with big questions, both conventional and new.

Intellectual and Practical Skills, including
- Inquiry and analysis
- Critical and creative thinking
- Written and oral communication
- Quantitative literacy
- Information literacy
- Teamwork and problem solving

Practiced extensively, across the curriculum, in the context of progressively more challenging problems, projects, and standards for performance

Personal and Social Responsibility, including
- Civic knowledge and engagement—local and global
- Intercultural knowledge and competence
- Ethical reasoning and action
- Foundations and skills for lifelong learning

Anchored through active involvement with diverse communities

Integrative and Applied Learning, including
- Synthesis and advanced accomplishment across general and specialized studies

Demonstrated through the application of knowledge, skills, and responsibilities to new settings and complex problems
**Employers:** Teamwork Skills are Important

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learning Outcomes</th>
<th>Employers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The ability to effectively communicate orally</td>
<td>85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ability to work effectively with others in teams</td>
<td>83%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ability to effectively communicate in writing</td>
<td>82%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethical judgment and decision-making</td>
<td>81%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critical thinking and analytical reasoning skills</td>
<td>81%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ability to apply knowledge and skills to real-world settings</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Students:** Teamwork Skills are Important

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employers</th>
<th>College Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The ability to effectively communicate orally</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ability to work effectively with others in teams</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ability to effectively communicate in writing</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethical judgment and decision-making</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critical thinking and analytical reasoning skills</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ability to apply knowledge and skills to real-world settings</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ability to analyze and solve complex problems</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ability to locate, organize, and evaluate information from multiple sources</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ability to innovate and be creative</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staying current on changing technologies and their applications to the workplace</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ability to work with numbers and understand statistics</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ability to analyze and solve problems with people from different backgrounds and cultures</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Awareness of and experience with diverse cultures and communities within the United States</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staying current on developments in science</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staying current on global developments and trends</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Awareness of and experience with cultures and societies outside of the United States</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proficiency in a language other than English</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

What is Teamwork

“…the nature and quality of individual team members’ contributions to the team”  (Hughes & Jones, 2011)

“… behaviors under the control of individual team members (effort they put into team tasks, their manner of interacting with others on team, and the quantity and quality of contributions they make to team discussions)”  (AACU/VALUE Rubric)

Teamwork (process) ≠ Team success (product)
Teamwork is Challenging to Assess

- Hard to observe
- Difficult to specify
- Subjective judgment
- Social factors that interfere

At CSUF: 55 SLOs (out of 569) are aligned with the “Teamwork” ULG
Approaches to Assess Teamwork

Hypothetical scenarios:

- Exam: Multiple choice; Short-answer

Actual experiences:

- Self evaluation
- Peer evaluation
- External observer evaluation
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>VALUE</th>
<th>CATME</th>
<th>Carnegie Mellon</th>
<th>U of Minnesota</th>
<th>San Diego State</th>
<th>Exam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contributes individually to the team</td>
<td>- Individual contributes in and outside of team meetings</td>
<td>- Participates actively in group activities</td>
<td></td>
<td>- Contributes individually (Researches/gathers/shares info); - Fulfills own team duties</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supports others’ contribution to the team</td>
<td>- Facilitates the contributions of other team members</td>
<td>- Recognizes different ways in which other team members contribute - Provides feedback pertaining to peers’ teamwork skills</td>
<td></td>
<td>- Recognizes and utilizes each member’s skill set; - Offers and accepts feedback</td>
<td>- Shares information equally</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Works with others of diverse/different backgrounds</td>
<td></td>
<td>- Demonstrates ability to work with people of diverse/different backgrounds</td>
<td></td>
<td>- Encourages questions and alternative viewpoints</td>
<td>- Considers all views; - Cooperates with and adapts to teammates</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrates interpersonal skills</td>
<td></td>
<td>- Demonstrates interpersonal skills in teamwork context</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Works with others to resolve conflict</td>
<td></td>
<td>- Responds to conflict</td>
<td></td>
<td>- Negotiates/compromises - Resolves conflicts without destroying group process</td>
<td>- Makes fair decisions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Builds a collaborative team culture</td>
<td></td>
<td>- Fosters constructive team climate</td>
<td></td>
<td>- Shared objectives; - Mutual respect</td>
<td>- Shared goals and contingency plan</td>
<td>- Listens to others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understands factors that affect team success</td>
<td>- Understands the factors necessary to work effectively on teams - Understands what an effective team process looks like</td>
<td></td>
<td>- Defines quality standards to judge team members’ contribution</td>
<td></td>
<td>- Understands the factors necessary to work effectively on teams</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Teamwork Assessment at CSUF

55 SLOs are aligned with the “Teamwork" ULG:

- 22 reported using direct measures
- 6 reported using indirect measures
- 26 reported using both types of measures
- 1 did not specify
### Teamwork Assessment at CSUF (cont.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reported Instruments Used</th>
<th># of Outcomes</th>
<th>% of Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locally-developed exam/test/quiz</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capstone project</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research paper/ project</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written assignment/ lab report</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None Identified</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student self-assessment</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benchmarks/ comparisons with peers</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portfolio evaluation of student work</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Essay question on exam</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral presentation or exhibition</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal evaluation of practical skills (clinical, educational, professional)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simulations</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thesis/ dissertation</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Course grades</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Reported Instruments Used

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instrument</th>
<th># of Outcomes</th>
<th>% of Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locally-developed exam/test/quiz</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capstone project</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research paper/ project</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written assignment/ lab report</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student self-assessment</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benchmarks/comparisons with peers</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portfolio evaluation of student work</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Essay question on exam</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral presentation or exhibition</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal evaluation of practical skills (clinical, educational, professional)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simulations</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thesis/ dissertation</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Course grades</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Design Your Own Teamwork Assessment

Join a group of similar disciplines:

- Design or refine your own approach to assess teamwork skills

Report back:

- An example of teamwork assessment
- Challenges you encountered
assessment@fullerton.edu

www.fullerton.edu/assessment