Program Performance Review
Summative Feedback Form Template

Collective Finalized Report due February 17, 2025

Just, Equitable, and Inclusive Education JEIE Overview
Just, Equitable, and Inclusive Education Resource Page

Program Performance Review (PPR) external reviewers are encouraged to access the Program Performance Review Guidelines prior to conducting the review. The external reviewers' report should comment on the **strengths, challenges, and recommendations** for each of the seven report sections identified in Section 6 of the guidelines ("Content Requirements and Elements of the Self-study") and any other observations they find significant. The following template is provided to help structure the report, but the external reviewers may follow different report structures if desired.

Program Name: EDEL MS C&I
Date of Review: 1/13/25
Name/s of Reviewers:Char Moffit, Liviera Lim, Maria Grant

Section #	Criteria	Reviewers' Response
I. Department/ Program Mission, Goals and Environment	**A.** Briefly describe the mission and goals of the unit and identify any changes since the last program review. Review the goals in relation to the University mission, goals, and strategies. **B.** Briefly describe changes and trends in the discipline and the response of the unit to such changes. Identify the external factors that impact the program (e.g., community/regional needs,	**Strengths:** A. The Department of Elementary and Bilingual Education (EDEL), which offers the Master of Science in Curriculum and Instruction (MS C&I), "promotes graduate students' ability to teach through an anti-racist lens using culturally and linguistically relevant strategies to provide equitable learning opportunities." The culmination of the program focuses on students' mastery of instruction that serves to support all students through a just, equitable, and inclusive education (JEIE) framework. Technology integration and community engagement are partner goals of this program, too. These aims parallel those of the College of Education at California State University, Fullerton. By the end of the program, candidates are expected to be proficient in providing instruction for all students using a JEIE underpinning.

<table>
<tr>
<td>

placement, and graduate/professional school).

C. Identify the unit's priorities for the next three (short term) and seven years (long term).

D. If there are programs offered in a Special Session self-support mode, describe how these programs are included in the mission, goals and priorities of the department/program (e.g., new student groups regionally, nationally, internationally, new delivery modes, etc.).

</td>
<td>

B. **Strength:** Recruitment efforts have been vigorous and include promotion on Instagram, email, and through social media. Recruitment also occurs at events such as Education Week, Discover CSUF Day, and others. Informational webinars are also offered. Recruitment of participants through school districts is also an effort. As veteran teachers retire, new openings become available. Those that are working on temporary teaching contracts to fill vacancy needs are considering the MS C&I to bolster their knowledge and skills so that they are hireable and highly qualified for full time positions.

C. **Strengths:** Three year priorities include: 1. increasing enrollment in the MS C&I so that full cohorts of 25 students are ready to start each fall semester. 2. Increasing the number of combined credential/MS C&I cohorts of 25 students (2 cohorts in fall/1 in spring). 3. Assign diverse faculty to teach MS C&I courses (perspective, ethnicity, language, culture). Update curriculum and resources through PLC sessions that focus on social justice and early childhood. Seven year priorities include: 1. Increasing enrollment in MS C&I to 2 cohorts of 50 total students enrolled (1 cohort focused on social justice and 1 cohort focused on early childhood). 2. Maintain 2 combined credential/MS C&I cohorts in the fall and 1 cohort in the spring. 3. Continue updating curriculum and resources through PLC efforts around social justice and early childhood.

D. N/A

</td>
</tr>
</table>

		Challenges A. **Challenges:** JEIE may not be an underpinning of partnering districts. B. **Challenges:** Students in the program increasingly have outside of school responsibilities, including working, raising families, and caring for others. Additionally, enrollment in the MS C&I program has decreased since 2021. Because of this there is no Fall 2024 cohort. There is, however, growing interest in the program in the combined credential and MS C&I program. C. **Challenges:** Finding teachers who have not participated in master's studies and targeting recruitment towards meeting their needs and goals.
		Recommendations A. **Recommendation:** Continue to seek out ways for students to offer high quality content instruction that is also rooted in JEIE. Ensuring that MTSS is foundational can support this goal B. **Recommendation**: Continue to explore ways to support busy students. Perhaps offering assignments that focus on the students' existing school duties. C. **Recommendation:** Consider working with a district to create a district cohort..

II. Department/Program Description and Analysis	**A.** Identify substantial curricular changes in existing programs and new programs (degrees, majors, minors) developed since the last program review. Have any programs been discontinued? **B.** Describe the structure of the degree program (e.g., identify required courses, how many units of electives, expected modalities of courses in the program) and identify the logic underlying the organization of the requirements and alignment of the requirements with the department resources. In particular, please discuss how the curriculum and/or programming reflects the University's commitment to diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI) or future revisions the program plans to make to address DEI in the curriculum. *Please make connections to the College of Education's focus on JEIE. These connections can occur in section I and/or II. **C.** Using data provided by the Office of Institutional Effectiveness and Planning to discuss student demand for the unit's offerings. Discuss topics such as over/under enrollment (applications, admissions, and enrollments), retention, graduation rates for majors (FTF and transfer), and time to degree. Address equity gaps in retention and graduation rates	Strengths A. Faculty collaborated to include JEIE principals, as they revised courses, rubrics, and assignments. Courses were also redesigned to be more suitable to the Canvas LMS. Instruction around research preparation (developing research questions, literature reviews, etc was implemented throughout the program, to address students' needs to prepare their research projects. B. There are options for program emphasis that students can choose from: concentration in social justice, early childhood, science education, and no concentration. Having these choices for focused study can build expertise in concentration areas and can attract students interested in specific areas of education. C. Data shows some fluctuations in enrollment. The focus of the MS C&I has changed from *education* to curriculum and instruction- a more focused, elevated emphasis. D. Enrollment increased between 2022-2023 and 2023-2024. E. Faculty worked in PLCs to align Program Student Learning Outcomes (PSLOs), and Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs) related to each course, and Just Equitable, and Inclusive Education (JEIE). Activities and assignments are connected to JEIE. Short Term Plans: Future PLC work will include: Students reflecting on their own assumptions; students examining the curricular and pedagogical value of family assets and community engagement; students analyzing, creating and implementing anti-bias curriculum; students engaging in social justice-based research and pedagogy. Long Term Plans: In Spring of 2025, faculty will meet in a PLC to update curriculum and curriculum resources. Recruitment efforts will be focused and far reaching. F. N/A

(see instructions, Appendices A and B).	

D. Discuss the unit's enrollment trends since the last program review based on enrollment targets (FTES), faculty allocation, and student faculty ratios. For graduate programs, comment on whether there is sufficient enrollment to constitute a community of scholars to conduct the program (see instructions, Appendices A and B). **E.** Describe any plans for curricular changes in the short (three-year) and long (seven-year) term, such as expansions, contractions, or discontinuances. Relate these plans to the priorities described above in section I. C (unit's future priorities). **F.** Include information on any Special Sessions self-support programs the department/program offers.	Challenges
	  A. Instructors had to learn a new LMS and redevelop and update curriculum to suit the LMS. They also had to integrate JEIE principals to current content in an effective manner.
	  B. Some concentrations may pull more students- balancing enrollments can be challenging.
	  C. Fall 2024 applications decreased due to competition (other universities offering MS degrees in education), potential students being overworked/too busy, a greater interest in the combined degree rather than in the stand alone MS C&I.
	  D. Enrollment decreased in fall 2024 due to students working, competition, and other issues.
	  E. Finding a population of educators that is ready for recruitment and offering enough flexibility to be attractive.

		Recommendations
		  A. Be sure that all instructors are familiar with the updates and curricular changes, to ensure instruction occurs with fidelity across the program.
		  B. Continue to advertise these concentrations, noting the nuanced variations between them and the connections they make to future educator employment (science resource or early education district lead, etc).
		  C. Continue targeted recruitment efforts, highlighting the concentrations as unique to the CSUF EDEL program. Provide testimonials (video, text on websites, etc) from MS C&I completers, explaining the benefits of the program in a personal way.
		  D. Again, target recruitment and showcase the specialized offerings of the MS C&I.
		  E. Find ways to support scholarships (grants) for students so they don't have to work as much while in the program.

III. Documentation of Student Academic Achievement and Assessment of Student Learning Outcomes	**A**. Describe the department/program assessment plan (e.g., general approach, timetable, etc.) and structure (e.g., committee, coordinator, etc.), and if applicable, how the plan and/or structure have changed since the last PPR.
	B. For each degree program, provide the student learning outcomes (SLOs); describe the methods, direct or indirect, used to measure student learning; and summarize the assessment results of the SLOs.
	C. Describe whether and how assessment results have been used
		Strengths
		  A. The assessment plan is clear and includes course program completion of 30 units with a 3.0 GPA and completion of a master's project and related coursework with a 3.0 overall GPA or approved thesis. Transition requirements are noted for each part of the program, from admissions, to program continuation, to qualification for culminating experience, to program exit. The program gathers feedback from surveys- diversity survey, midpoint survey, exit survey, and end of program survey.
		  B. The "Reach. Teach. Impact." framework underpins the MS C&I student learning outcomes. More specifically, candidates: 1.reflect on their assumptions including biases to strengthen their understanding of power, privilege, and positionality. 2.Candidates critically examine the curricular and pedagogical value of family assets and community engagement to develop the professional expertise and leadership skills. 3. Candidates analyze, create and implement anti-bias curriculum, including digital curriculum and materials that develops academic content knowledge and

	to improve teaching and learning practices, inform faculty professional development, and/or overall departmental effectiveness. Please cite specific examples. **D.** Describe other quality indicators identified by the department/program as evidence of student learning and effectiveness/success other than student learning outcomes (e.g., number of students attending graduate or professional school, job placement rates, community engagement/leadership). **E.** Many departments/programs offer courses and programs via technology (e.g., online) or at off-campus sites and in compressed schedules. How are these courses identified, and how is student learning assessed in these formats/modalities?	disrupts oppressive practices. 4. Candidates will analyze, critique, and apply knowledge of theoretical and historical research, relevant theories, and pedagogies related to asset-based, equity- and justice oriented teaching and learning in education. The exit survey provides feedback on JEIE, technology, and community. The program has signature assignments in courses and data shows that at least 90% of students have met or exceed passing criteria. This is commendable. Collaborative faculty teams have reviewed data/assessments to update program and coursework. C. Program faculty examine exit survey data and make improvements to specific, related courses. D. The MS C&I program uses Google Classroom to keep in touch with alumni. Additionally, the faculty regularly review assessments at meetings. Data and feedback from former program completers indicates, "Most students indicated that they would recommend the program, and the strongest aspects of the program were the supportive staff and faculty, organized curriculum, collaboration with peers, and the pacing of the program." E. All course are online and include online assessment and feedback for students. Faculty use Canvas tools (rubrics, quizzes, etc). The

	Challenges: A. The use of survey data to modify programs can be challenging. Finding ways to engage in discussions that center around the data and ways to use it could be part of department and PLC agendas. B. Finding ways to ensure fidelity to the signature assignment scoring and work could be challenging. C. Areas of low scores on the exit survey include: students reporting a clear understanding of systems of oppression with only 48.8% (Fall 2023) and 28.6% (Spring 2024) AND students stating they have opportunities to dismantle systems of oppression with only 44% (Fall 2023) and 42.9% (Spring 2024). D. Program enrollment in the MS C&I has declined in recent years; although graduate program enrollment was up in 2023-2024. This is due to the interest in the combined program (credential/MS C&I).

		Recommendations:
		   A. Perhaps survey data be used to inform changes that remediate admissions concerns (ie- getting more applicants to start and complete the program).
		   B. Continue examining data and focus on student empowerment to work to change systems of oppression through collaborative efforts. This is challenging.
		   C. Finding ways to guide students to examine collaborative efforts, including those that already exist, to work to dismantle systems of oppression would be meaningful.
		   D. Continue program information and recruitment efforts.

IV.
 Faculty
	A. Describe changes since the last program review in the full-time equivalent faculty (FTEF) allocated to the department or program. Include information on tenured and tenure track faculty lines (e.g., new hires, retirements, FERP's, resignations) and how these changes may have affected the program's or department's academic offerings and the department's long-term goals. Describe tenure density in the program/department and the distribution among academic rank (assistant, associate, professor) [see instructions, Appendix C]. Attach faculty vitae (see Appendix D).
	 B. Describe priorities for faculty positions. Explain how these priorities and future hiring plans relate to relevant changes in the discipline; student enrollment and
		Strengths
		   A. All faculty teaching the courses must have a doctoral degree, ensuring a deep body of knowledge within the field and high standard of academic background.
		   B. The new faculty hired bolster program offerings with their background and expertise.
		   C. The continuing department faculty represent a strong, well-rounded, and diverse body of professionals to support the students.

	demographics; the career objectives of students; the planning of the University; and regional, national, or global developments. **C.** Describe the role of tenure line faculty, lecturers, and graduate/student assistants in the program/department's curriculum and academic offerings. Indicate the number and percentage of courses taught by part-time faculty teaching assistants. Identify any parts of the curriculum that are solely or primarily the responsibility of part-time faculty or teaching assistants. **D.** Include information on instructor participation in Special Sessions self- support programs offered by the department/program.	Challenges A. There is a need to search for, recruit, and hire two new tenure-track positions.
		Recommendations A. It would behoove students and the program for cohorts to have opportunities to connect with more university faculty in the education department during the course of the program. Students may feel more supported in a mentorship capacity, or have more resources and thought partners for their culminating project.

V.
Student Support and Advising
	A. Briefly describe how the department advises its majors, minors, and graduate students and the effectiveness of this advising structure. Describe the support from outside the department that is necessary for students to receive	Strengths
		    ● The two required sessions required before students begin the graduate program help to onboard them into the program and set expectations for the course.
		    ● Advising during transition points helps success during critical times in the program and provide help to students when they need the most support.
		    ● Optional check ins with an advisor allow students to opt in when they are in need

	additional information that they need. **B.** Describe opportunities for students to participate in departmental honors programs, undergraduate or graduate research, collaborative research with faculty, service learning, internships, etc. How are these opportunities made available and accessible to students? List the faculty and students participating in each type of activity and indicate any plans the department has for increasing these activities.	of support and make them feel like part of a learning community that sets them up for success.
		Challenges ● Practical opportunities for applying learning exist primarily within each students' own current roles / jobs. While there are some group projects, there is a lack of opportunities to branch out and apply skills in novel ways or environments.
		Recommendations ● Explore opportunities for working with university staff on research, or with other organizations / connections on service-learning opportunities, especially during the summer if possible.
VI. Resources and Facilities	**A.** Itemize the state support and non-state resources the program/department received during the last seven years (see instructions, Appendix E). **B.** Identify any special facilities/equipment used by the program/department, such as laboratories, computers, large classrooms, or performance spaces. Identify changes over the last seven years and prioritize needs for the future. **C.** Describe the current library/research resources for the program/department, the priorities for acquisitions over the next seven years, and any	Strengths ● Technology resources are available for student use, such as Peardeck and BreakoutEDU. ● Course materials and books are provided at no cost to students. ● There is an established committee working to improve programs (see page 30). ● There is a dedicated librarian to support students with how to do research in education, as well as a plethora of no-cost library resources such as scholarly databases. ● The program offers strong financial investment in program improvement and professional development.

	specialized needs such as collections, databases, etc.	**Challenges**
		Recommendations ● Research allocating funds into providing access to tech-forward platforms or professional development opportunities for students to implement in their teaching that equips them for the changing technological landscape (i.e. the use of AI, EdTech, etc).
VII. Long-term Plans	**A.** Summarize the unit's long-term plan, including refining the definitions of the goals and strategies in terms of indicators of quality and measures of productivity (see instructions, Appendix F) **B.** Explain how the long-term plan implements the University's mission, goals, and strategies, as well as the unit's mission and goals. **C**. Explain what kinds of evidence will be used to measure the unit's results in pursuit of its goals, how the unit will collect and analyze such evidence, and the timeline against which progress toward those goals will be measured. **D.** Describe the resources (internal and external) that may be necessary, available, and/or attainable to meet the unit's priorities. Describe new funding	**Strengths** ● Listening sessions with alumni will inform more on possible barriers to receiving a masters degree and current needs of program alumni. ● The focus on recruiting for the MS program will bolster program numbers. ● Recruiting diverse faculty from a variety of research focuses and professional backgrounds highlights the scope of existing education careers. ● Strengthened professional development opportunities support faculty and staff growth.
		Challenges ● There is a lack of connections to non-traditional learning environments that could be fostered or built, or encouraged for students to do so. ● Recruiting diverse staff in the wake of current federal politics may be tricky.

	that may be needed to maintain educational quality. Discuss the appropriate balance between state-supported and external funding. Discussion in this section should address the needs identified in areas I-VI above, with the understanding that the ability to meet strategic goals depends on available resources.	Recommendations ● Identification of community partners (informal learning centers, nonprofits, etc) could support students' networks or provide opportunities for potential partnership in classrooms. ● A writing coach for students could bolster academic writing skills, or the exploration of writing tools may support students in this way.
VIII. Appendices		
Other Comments:		