

**Program Performance Review  
Summative Feedback Form Template**

**Collective Finalized Report due February 17, 2025**

[Just, Equitable, and Inclusive Education JEIE Overview](#)  
[Just, Equitable, and Inclusive Education Resource Page](#)

[Program Performance Review \(PPR\)](#) external reviewers are encouraged to access the Program Performance Review Guidelines prior to conducting the review. The external reviewers’ report should comment on the **strengths, challenges, and recommendations** for each of the seven report sections identified in Section 6 of the guidelines (“Content Requirements and Elements of the Self-study”) and any other observations they find significant. The following template is provided to help structure the report, but the external reviewers may follow different report structures if desired.

Program Name: CSUF EdD

Date of Review: February 13, 2025

Name/s of Reviewers: Kitty Fortner, Paolo Varquez, Gary Germa

Section #	Criteria	Reviewers’ Response
<b>I. Department/Program Mission, Goals and Environment</b>	<b>A.</b> Briefly describe the mission and goals of the unit and identify any changes since the last program review. Review the goals in relation to the University mission, goals, and strategies.  <b>B.</b> Briefly describe changes and trends in the discipline and the response of the unit to such changes. Identify the external factors that impact the program (e.g.,	Strengths <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The EdD program’s missions and goals are aligned with CSUF’s mission, goals, and strategies</li> <li>● In their commitment to continuous improvement, the EdD Program continues to align program and leadership competencies to support the changing demands of leadership in educational organizations</li> <li>● The program has aspirations to open a fully online EDD Program within the next few year which will open the door to trends and changes in the discipline which began before the onslaught of COVID 19. The political landscape, demographic shifts, and the use of AI are changes that are shifting the way education is addressed in California and the US. The program seems to be aware of these shifts and is working to remain responsive to the needs of their students through the revision of the Mission and Vision statements and the adoption of six core competencies in 2020 to assist them in operationalizing their vision</li> </ul>

<p>community/regional needs, placement, and graduate/professional school).</p> <p><b>C.</b> Identify the unit’s priorities for the next three (short term) and seven years (long term).</p> <p><b>D.</b> If there are programs offered in a Special Session self-support mode, describe how these programs are included in the mission, goals and priorities of the department/program (e.g., new student groups regionally, nationally, internationally, new delivery modes, etc.).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Shifting EdD program structure modality to hybrid program are well received by the students</li> </ul>
	<p>Challenges</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Changes in the government and political landscape in education promises to provide challenges to any program in support of DEI work in schools.</li> <li>● Students asking for better dissertation support</li> <li>● Students are confused on expectations for milestones such as qualifying exams, dissertation proposal and defense</li> <li>● Some faculty, possibly part-time instructors, may not have information on students' progress, which could make the sequencing feel misaligned from the learner's perspective</li> </ul>
	<p>Recommendations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Incorporate a strengths-based approach where leaders recognize and leverage the already-existing assets of communities, families, and populations</li> <li>● Address the needs of the community partners and schools to be incorporated into the curriculum or program plan</li> <li>● Embed generative artificial intelligence (GenAI) in the EdD curriculum as mentioned on page 3 of the self-study. It is imperative that educational leaders have an understanding of how to use GenAI as it is one of the highest demand skills (<a href="#">World Economic Forum</a>, 2025). CSUF also recently launched TitanGPT that the EdD program could leverage</li> <li>● Develop a comprehensive dissertation handbook outlining clear expectations, timelines, and resources for students. For example, create a visual timeline of milestones along with a more detailed document that shows smaller milestones (e.g. semester 2, complete chapter 1 of dissertation proposal</li> <li>● Professional development for faculty in designing hybrid pedagogies in their teaching</li> <li>● Be more intentional in involving students, alumni, and community partners in discussions about JEIE practices (e.g. how alumni have applied JEIE in their work)</li> </ul>

<p><b>II. Department/Program Description and Analysis</b></p>	<p><b>A.</b> Identify substantial curricular changes in existing programs and new programs (degrees, majors, minors) developed since the last program review. Have any programs been discontinued?</p> <p><b>B.</b> Describe the structure of the degree program (e.g., identify required courses, how many units of electives, expected modalities of courses in the program) and identify the logic underlying the organization of the requirements and alignment of the requirements with the department resources. In particular, please discuss how the curriculum and/or programming reflects the University’s commitment to diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI) or future revisions the program plans to make to address DEI in the curriculum. *Please make connections to the College of Education’s focus on JEIE. These</p>	<p>Strengths</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Substantial curricular changes in the last three years             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Implementation of hybrid modality for both specializations starting Fall 2024 to support flexibility</li> <li>○ P12 concentration introduced dissertation support courses</li> <li>○ Continued alignment with CPED</li> </ul> </li> <li>● Curriculum for the program is current and up to date (e.g. textbooks, research articles)</li> <li>● Structure of the degree program             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ CSUF EdD offers separate concentrations that are academically rigorous: P-12 and Community College educational leadership</li> <li>○ JEIE is embedded in the curriculum (e.g. syllabi)</li> <li>○ Cohort model contributed to a sense of community and personalized support</li> <li>○ Research support seminar courses are included every semester to support on-time completion of program</li> <li>○ Milestones are spread out evenly</li> </ul> </li> <li>● 2024 Closing the Loop Data             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Preparation for culturally responsive leadership</li> <li>○ Data gathered from a variety of stakeholders                 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ Students</li> <li>■ Faculty</li> <li>■ Alumni</li> <li>■ Employers</li> </ul> </li> <li>○ Data gathered in a variety of methods                 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ Exit survey</li> <li>■ Employee Survey</li> <li>■ Dissertation Rubric</li> <li>■ Dissertation Defense Data</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul>
---	---	---

	<p>connections can occur in section I and/or II.</p> <p><b>C.</b> Using data provided by the Office of Institutional Effectiveness and Planning to discuss student demand for the unit’s offerings. Discuss topics such as over/under enrollment (applications, admissions, and enrollments), retention, graduation rates for majors (FTF and transfer), and time to degree. Address equity gaps in retention and graduation rates (see instructions, Appendices A and B).</p> <p><b>D.</b> Discuss the unit’s enrollment trends since the last program review based on enrollment targets (FTES), faculty allocation, and student faculty ratios. For graduate programs, comment on whether there is sufficient enrollment to constitute a community of scholars to conduct the program (see instructions, Appendices A and B).</p>	<p>Challenges</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>● Improve recruitment plan to address low enrollment numbers</li><li>● Decline in student applications since 2017</li><li>● Some students indicated not being supported or adequately prepared, particularly in the dissertation process</li><li>● Some students felt inadequately prepared to work with diverse communities</li><li>● Low graduation rates within three years</li><li>● Low response rates for Exit Surveys and Advanced year-Out Employer Surveys</li><li>● Support to keep students active and engaged for hybrid and online courses - responses not to determine any significant themes or trends</li></ul>
--	--	---

	<p><b>E.</b> Describe any plans for curricular changes in the short (three-year) and long (seven-year) term, such as expansions, contractions, or discontinuances. Relate these plans to the priorities described above in section I. C (unit’s future priorities).</p> <p><b>F.</b> Include information on any Special Sessions self-support programs the department/program offers.</p>	<p>Recommendations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Recruitment             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Create intentional data tracking on recruitment and application processes</li> <li>○ Leverage alumni network to help with recruitment efforts</li> <li>○ Invite employers to alumni events</li> </ul> </li> <li>● Data collection             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Collect more data (e.g. focus groups, interviews) for students who felt that they were not being fully supported or adequately prepared to get feedback on their experience and ask for suggestions on what the EdD program could do to improve and what types of support they feel would benefit them to successful completion of the program</li> <li>○ Provide higher incentives (e.g. gift cards) for Exit Surveys and Advanced Year-Out Employer Survey to increase response rates</li> <li>○ It is unclear how often or how long folks have to complete the exit surveys. Examine the procedure used to increase participation so that data can be more indicative of what the program needs to know</li> <li>○ Include one, qualitative opened question for the exit survey and employee survey</li> <li>○ Consider an end-of-course/semester survey to assess students earlier than at the end of the program to be able to address issues before they become large</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
<p><b>III. Documentation of Student Academic Achievement and Assessment of Student Learning Outcomes</b></p>	<p><b>A.</b> Describe the department/program assessment plan (e.g., general approach, timetable, etc.) and structure (e.g., committee, coordinator, etc.), and if applicable, how the plan and/or structure have changed since the last PPR.</p>	<p>Strengths</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Many forms of assessments other than SLOs are utilized for continuous improvement of the EdD program for faculty to monitor: dissertation rubrics, graduation rates, attrition, SoQs, Exit Surveys, employer feedback, alumni connections</li> <li>● The assessment plan seems to have the appropriate questions for continuous program improvement</li> <li>● Faculty participate in the evaluation process for continuous improvement</li> <li>● The assessment results have led to changes in three areas: (a) increased dissertation support, (b) Curriculum review and redesign, and (c) faculty development</li> </ul>

	<p><b>B.</b> For each degree program, provide the student learning outcomes (SLOs); describe the methods, direct or indirect, used to measure student learning; and summarize the assessment results of the SLOs.</p> <p><b>C.</b> Describe whether and how assessment results have been used to improve teaching and learning practices, inform faculty professional development, and/or overall departmental effectiveness. Please cite specific examples.</p> <p><b>D.</b> Describe other quality indicators identified by the department/program as evidence of student learning and effectiveness/success other than student learning outcomes (e.g., number of students attending graduate or professional school, job placement rates, community engagement/leadership).</p> <p><b>E.</b> Many departments/programs offer courses and programs via</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Students on the exit survey were generally high ratings in the following areas: (a) research engagement and theory-practice linkage, (b) culturally relevant and anti-racist strategies, and (c) graduate preparedness</li> <li>● Plans for leveraging GenAI in teaching and learning for faculty development</li> <li>● Steady completion rates for doctoral candidates</li> <li>● Positive experiences with the cohort model and faculty support evidence in SoQs and Exit Surveys</li> </ul> <p>Challenges</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Data from Exit Surveys and Advanced Year-Out Employer Survey is not reliable and valid due to low response rates</li> <li>● Student variability in responses when it comes to APA formatting and writing standards</li> <li>● Variability (e.g. comfort, skill level, motivation) in teaching online for faculty</li> <li>● Low graduation rates for students who complete within 3 years</li> </ul> <p>Recommendations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Develop methods to increase survey response rates</li> <li>● Identify methods to collect data directly related to program SLOs (end-of-course/semester surveys)</li> <li>● Differentiate between program learning outcomes and EDD competencies. Currently, the PLOs and SLOs are the same but they are not identified in the curriculum map, whereas the competencies are clearly identified in your curriculum map.</li> <li>● Current SLOs need to be broken down into multiple outcomes as opposed to having more than one measurement per outcome. This will support the data collection to be more reliable and aligned with the specific focus.</li> <li>● Utilization of GenAI to assess surveys and develop strategies for continuous improvement</li> <li>● Faculty mentoring in online teaching and learning</li> </ul>
--	---	---

	<p>technology (e.g., online) or at off-campus sites and in compressed schedules. How are these courses identified, and how is student learning assessed in these formats/modalities?</p>	
<p><b>IV. Faculty</b></p>	<p><b>A.</b> Describe changes since the last program review in the full-time equivalent faculty (FTEF) allocated to the department or program. Include information on tenured and tenure track faculty lines (e.g., new hires, retirements, FERP’s, resignations) and how these changes may have affected the program’s or department’s academic offerings and the department’s long-term goals. Describe tenure density in the program/department and the distribution among academic rank (assistant, associate, professor) [see instructions, Appendix C]. Attach faculty vitae (see Appendix D).</p>	<p>Strengths</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Experienced faculty with extensive research publications, presentations, teaching roles, and leadership positions</li> <li>● Maintained a robust team of eleven full-time tenure-track faculty, two distinguished lecturers, and several affiliated faculty members</li> <li>● The stability within the faculty structure enables consistency in program offerings</li> <li>● Well-balanced tenure density with a mix of professors, associate professors, and assistant professors</li> <li>● Full-time faculty now teach approximately 80% of the core curriculum, supervise dissertations, and provide mentorship.</li> <li>● Part-time faculty continue to teach about 20% of the courses, focusing on specialized topics</li> <li>● Experienced part-time faculty that bring current in field experience including executive and administrative roles (e.g. Superintendent, Principal, President, Vice president, Dean, Director, Board of Director)</li> <li>● Hired three new faculty members for the Community College concentration</li> </ul>

	<p><b>B.</b> Describe priorities for faculty positions. Explain how these priorities and future hiring plans relate to relevant changes in the discipline; student enrollment and demographics; the career objectives of students; the planning of the University; and regional, national, or global developments.</p> <p><b>C.</b> Describe the role of tenure line faculty, lecturers, and graduate/student assistants in the program/department’s curriculum and academic offerings. Indicate the number and percentage of courses taught by part-time faculty teaching assistants. Identify any parts of the curriculum that are solely or primarily the responsibility of part-time faculty or teaching assistants.</p> <p><b>D.</b> Include information on instructor participation in Special Sessions self- support</p>	<p>Challenges</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Increase demand for individualized dissertation support</li> <li>● Faculty experienced in online pedagogy and instructional design</li> </ul>
		<p>Recommendations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Improve onboarding process and mentorship for part-time faculty to ensure they design their courses in alignment with the program’s competencies and the right sequence</li> <li>● Use Master Syllabi to maintain consistency with part-time faculty alignment with the program needs and goals</li> <li>● Bi-annual Faculty Meeting where all faculty part-time and full-time come together to align/realign with program goals, changes, etc.</li> <li>● Continued faculty training on dissertation advising best practices for consistent guidance across students</li> <li>● Hire faculty with experience in delivering successful online education and teaching in preparation for hybrid and online cohorts</li> </ul>

	<p>programs offered by the department/program.</p>	
<p><b>V. Student Support and Advising</b></p>	<p><b>A.</b> Briefly describe how the department advises its majors, minors, and graduate students and the effectiveness of this advising structure. Describe the support from outside the department that is necessary for students to receive additional information that they need.</p> <p><b>B.</b> Describe opportunities for students to participate in departmental honors programs, undergraduate or graduate research, collaborative research with faculty, service learning, internships, etc. How are these opportunities made available and accessible to students? List the faculty and students participating in each type of activity and indicate any plans the department has for increasing these activities.</p>	<p>Strengths</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Dedicated Student Affairs Advisor to support students for course registration and addressing any issues related to course planning and enrollment</li> <li>● Faculty members remain with the same Research Support Seminar (EDD 670 series) group over multiple semesters, maintaining a consistent and supportive advising relationship</li> <li>● Student access to the Center for Research and Educational Access and Leadership (CREAL) which helps with research opportunities, improving research skills, mentoring</li> <li>● EdD graduates presentations at research conferences like CPED, AERA, and AACC</li> </ul> <p>Challenges</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● No data that shows CREAL assisting with student dissertations (e.g. number served, what services are being utilized)</li> </ul>
		<p>Recommendations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Faculty mentoring to include networking and career development opportunities</li> <li>● Leveraging alumni network for research opportunities, networking, service learning, internships, and career development</li> <li>● Creating more data around student presentations at conferences and publication of articles in order to attract more students who are interested in moving into higher education</li> <li>● Generate EdD newsletters that include deadlines, research opportunities, program updates, student highlights, student research, campus resources (e.g. CAPS), etc.</li> <li>● Create a process to collect data from CREAL utilization</li> </ul>

<p><b>VI. Resources and Facilities</b></p>	<p><b>A.</b> Itemize the state support and non-state resources the program/department received during the last seven years (see instructions, Appendix E).</p> <p><b>B.</b> Identify any special facilities/equipment used by the program/department, such as laboratories, computers, large classrooms, or performance spaces. Identify changes over the last seven years and prioritize needs for the future.</p> <p><b>C.</b> Describe the current library/research resources for the program/department, the priorities for acquisitions over the next seven years, and any specialized needs such as collections, databases, etc.</p>	<p>Strengths</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Modern classrooms with technology (e.g. two Zoom classrooms) that support hybrid learning</li> <li>● Enrollment-based budget - if enrollment is down then funding is down</li> <li>● Funding used to expand library resources, otter.ai, and CREAL and to host seminar series to enrich doctoral culture and environment</li> <li>● (CP 550 and CP 560) includes receiving new desks and chairs, technology upgrades</li> <li>● environment</li> <li>● The Educational Leadership office suite has been refurbished to provide a more professional and welcoming space creating an environment that supports engagement, collaboration, and productivity</li> <li>● methodologies. Students can access tools like SPSS, Qualtrics, and Dedoose to analyze and interpret their data effectively</li> <li>● A librarian specifically assigned to the Educational Leadership program,</li> </ul>
		<p>Challenges</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Sustaining enrollment so the program can grow in financial ways to grow its resources</li> <li>● Keeping up with technology changes that accompany online needs as they move to have an online cohort</li> </ul>
		<p>Recommendations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Annual audit of space and technology needs to continue to remain up to date with technology</li> <li>● Include a question on space and technology questions on exit surveys to gather student data and recommendations</li> <li>● Consider the placement of the online cohort for financial implications (extended ed or stateside)</li> <li>● Leveraging GenAI (e.g. TitanGPT) for dissertation support such as transcriptions, APA formatting, and general research - could possibly replace otter.ai. TitanGPT is the plus version of Chat GPT which has more advanced capabilities compared to the free version and data is also secured</li> <li>● Leveraging CREAL for dissertation support</li> </ul>

<p><b>VII. Long-term Plans</b></p>	<p><b>A.</b> Summarize the unit’s long-term plan, including refining the definitions of the goals and strategies in terms of indicators of quality and measures of productivity (see instructions, Appendix F)</p> <p><b>B.</b> Explain how the long-term plan implements the University’s mission, goals, and strategies, as well as the unit’s mission and goals.</p> <p><b>C.</b> Explain what kinds of evidence will be used to measure the unit’s results in pursuit of its goals, how the unit will collect and analyze such evidence, and the timeline against which progress toward those goals will be measured.</p> <p><b>D.</b> Describe the resources (internal and external) that may be necessary, available, and/or attainable to meet the unit’s priorities. Describe new funding that may be needed to maintain educational quality. Discuss</p>	<p>Strengths</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Commitment to maintaining high-quality learning experiences and producing leaders capable of addressing JEIE</li> <li>● Aligned with CoE Strategic goals             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Develop an online EdD program</li> <li>○ Offer PD opportunities</li> <li>○ Commitment to JEIE</li> </ul> </li> <li>● Already existing robust forms of evidence to measure its progress which include direct measures, indirect measures, and tracking progress</li> <li>● Budget is planned for professional development in hybrid teaching strategies</li> <li>● Objectives are clear in refining goals and strategies to maintain a high-quality learning experience</li> </ul>
		<p>Challenges</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● As the program is considering moving to a fully online cohort, ensuring quality and engagement for the fully online EdD program</li> <li>● Alumni network programming is in development - participation is limited due to work commitments, time constraints, etc.</li> <li>● Measuring progress to assess new goals and strategies due to low survey responses</li> <li>● Evidence in supporting diversity of students in the program</li> </ul>
		<p>Recommendations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Create a data collection protocol that allows for maximum response</li> <li>● Provide evidence of how the program is meeting program goals</li> <li>● Leverage alumni network for strengthening partnerships and help with outreach in relation to the goal of increasing enrollment. Events are probably best to host after regular work hours or on the weekends</li> <li>● Include language on college-wide AI policy in relation to <a href="#">Goal 1, Objective 3 of CoE strategic goals</a></li> <li>● Include a representative from <a href="#">Counseling and Psychological Services (CAPS)</a> during EdD orientation in relation to <a href="#">Goal 2, Objective 1 of CoE strategic goals</a>. EdD is a</li> </ul>

	<p>the appropriate balance between state-supported and external funding. Discussion in this section should address the needs identified in areas I-VI above, with the understanding that the ability to meet strategic goals depends on available resources.</p>	<p>rigorous program and students should know and utilize the resources that are available to them. A section on mental health for the EdD newsletter would also be a good idea</p>
<p><b>VIII. Appendices</b></p>		
<p><b>Other Comments:</b></p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The EdD program’s commitment to JEIE is displayed through the self-study, website, and curriculum</li> <li>● Leverage CREAL, GenAI, and alumni network to enhance dissertation support</li> <li>● Development of a fully online EdD program will extend reach to prospective applicants and will increase revenue</li> <li>● Conduct a national review of EdD programs (both onsite and online) to identify best practices, online/hybrid models, dissertation support structures, alumni network, and other innovative programming</li> </ul>